David Kernan 1107 Sheldon Drive Altamont NY, 12209

3063 Carleton Island Rd 1 Cape Vincent NY

January 18, 2024

Town of Cape Vincent Zoning Board of Appeals c/o Cody Higgins Email address: codyh32686@gmail.com

> Re: Ron Clapp Special Use Permit Application dated October 4, 2023 Recognition of Prescriptive Easements Currently Used by Property Owners on the Head of Carleton Island

Dear Town of Cape Vincent Zoning Board of Appeals:

This letter is written on behalf of the members of the William Kernan Carleton Island Club LLC which owns three properties on the head of Carleton Island (the "Head"). These properties include one parcel consisting of approximately three acres lying on the northwestern end of the Head of Carleton Island which was conveyed by John Hance to the Carleton Island Club (unrelated to the present owner) in 1875 and 1881 (the "Club Parcel"), a second parcel consisting of somewhat less than an acre lying nearer the southeastern end of the head of Carleton Island on which a cottage and guesthouse are located which was conveyed by Charles and Mary Parkhurst to William and Katharine Kernan in 1956 (the "Main House Parcel") and a third parcel consisting of a boathouse and adjacent land lying near the southwest corner of South Bay which was also conveyed by Charles and Mary Parkhurst to William and Katharine Kernan in 1956 (the "Boathouse").

John Hance acquired all of the land constituting the Head of Carleton Island, as well as the "Neck" connecting the Head of the Island to the "Body" of the Island as well as the western portion of the "Body" of the Island consisting of about 480 acres from Euphasine and Isadore Pluche, as a single parcel, in 1868. Hance subdivided the land on the Head of the Island and sold subdivided parcels to various persons (the "Original Cottage Owners") during the 1880s. The deeds providing for the conveyance of the subdivided parcels to the Original Cottage Owners (including the Carleton Island Club) included easements intended to permit the Original Cottage Owners to travel from their respective parcels (1) to their respective boathouses as well as (2) a steamboat landing and wharf at the southeastern end of the Head of the Island, and (3) along a "road" adjacent to the western shore of South Bay that traverses the Neck of the Island and leads from the Head to the Body of the Island. John Hance and, later, his son, Sylvanus,

intended to establish "roads" running along the southern and western shores of South Bay, but the existence of these "roads" was never formalized and the "roads" have simply been used as paths by the Original Cottage owners and their successors. Over the first 30 or 40 years, the paths actually used by the Original Cottage Owners and their successors in interest shifted in some places from the descriptions of the easements and "roads" but it is accurate to say that the paths and "roads" used by the successors of the Original Cottage Owners have been fixed for at least the past 70 years and, to the extent they differ from the deed descriptions, constitute prescriptive easements enjoyed by the successors of the Original Cottage Owners.

The successors of the Original Cottage Owners at this time include not only the William Kernan Carleton Island Club LLC but also the Hickory Point Club Ltd., Charles and William Millar, Salvadore Checho and Amanda Dunlop.

We recite this history because both the site plan submitted by Ron Clapp together with his Special Use Permit application, dated October 4, 2023, to the Zoning Board of Appeals, and the revised site plan submitted in January 2024, ignore the existence of these easements and proposes the construction of pathways, buildings and a septic field that would interfere with and in some instances block the use of these easements by the successors of the Original Cottage Owners. Enclosed with this letter is a photocopies of Mr. Clapp's original and revised site plans showing in black marker the aforementioned easements superimposed on the site plans. We believe that the rights of the successors of the Original Cottage Owners to the continued use of these easements in their present locations would be protected by New York State courts in the event that any development on Mr. Clapp's parcel interferes with their use by the successors of the Original Cottage Owners. We urge the Zoning Board of Appeals to require that any site plan offered by Mr. Clapp include a recognition and description of these easements.

(We also note that the site plan proposed by Mr. Clapp suggests that a stairway leading from the top of the bluff overlooking South Bay could be used by his guests to access the Villa site on his parcel from the Neck of the Island site on his parcel. That stairway and the path leading to it from the Villa site are owned by Charles and William Millar and are available solely to their permittees.)

Sincerely,

cc: James Burrows, Esq. jburrows@kwbattorneys.com

I murel Kernan

Ronald Clapp

Applicant: Ron Clapp Address: 146 Centre Street, Cape Vincent, NY 13618

Carleton Island Rd. 1

_{олжі:} Carleton Villa, LLC.

STE PLAN

DELAWA 97: NS BLYENED 97: 10/4/2023 PRODECT 70: 23-072

ORIGINAL

SITE PLAN

DRAWN BY:
NS
REVIEWED BY:
MS
DATE:
1/4/2024
PROJECT IO:
22-477

Carleton Island Rd. 1 Tex Map Percel No. 39.27-1-16 In Town of Cape Vincent

CARLETON VILLA

FOR INFORMATION ONLY. NOT FOR CONSTRUCTION.

table, fire pit, grill and solar pane

REVISED

Legend Site Boundary	Major Contour Minor Contour Minor Contour Minor Contour	 6 wide muchtgravel path 3 wide muchtgravel path Phyaits access path Low Landscape or Bush Existing Conferous Treas to remain Existing Conferous Treas to remain With bendings	STE DATA: CABNS	Note: 1. Each unit shall have a picnic table, fire pit, grill and solar picnic table. Zoning Law: Town of Cape Vincent Section 2, blands District of the shorts within the boundaries of the Town The Bianche Device consets of few labrids within the boundaries and funda Careton The Consets of the labrids partie of infrared and funda Careton The Consets of the labrids within the boundaries and funda Careton The Consets of the labrids and the labrids and the labrids are an annual Careton for the labrids and the labrids and the labrid of the labrids and the labrid of the fare and the process. This defort impression and effective infrared area when it infrared the labrids in the labrids and included the labrids and the labrids and the labrids and encouraging quality reliabilist the labrids and the labrids of the factors of the council of the labrids of the labrids of the labrids of the labrid is transfer and the labrids of the labrids.	
			The state of the s		