List of correspondence being provided to Cape Vincent Zoning/Planning/Town Boards – 12/4/23

The 26 writers listed below, most of whom are unable to attend tonight's Hearings, requested that I provide you with copies of their correspondence to help ensure that their voices are being heard regarding the Special Permit Application of Ron Clapp/Carleton Island Villa.

- Todd Atkinson
- Andrew Bott
- John & Elisabeth Chisholm
- Eileen Comerford
- Mike Comerford
- David Cocuyt
- Ellen Denizard
- DJ Dunlap
- Michael & Jane Falvey
- Bill Ferguson
- Lois Giamber
- Ava Glantz
- Ian Golden
- Alec Johnson/Hickory Point Club
- Will Kernan
- Doris King & Connor Hoffman
- Vilma & Les Lawrence
- Christine & Adrian Martin
- Charles Millar
- Het Sabo
- Steph Sabo
- Stephan Sabo
- Julie & Nik Searles
- Carol & Dan Thomas
- Emily Waterman & Evan Farrell
- Leanne Waterman

Thank you, on their behalf, and on my own, for taking our concerns into serious consideration in this matter.

Respectfully submitted,

Carol Thomas

Carol Thomas

Carleton Island Resident – ownership since 1992
Angel Rock Waterfront Cottages & Vacation Homes. – ownership since 1997

TODD ATKINSON

To: Cody Higgins (via email codyh32686@gmail.com)
From: Todd Atkinson
Re: Cape Vincent Zoning Board – Special Use Permit Application
Date: November 27, 2023

Dear Cody,

I've just learned of the Special Use Permit Application submitted by Ron Clapp c/o Carleton Island LLC with respect to the Carleton Island Villa lot.

The proposed use appears entirely inconsistent with the current land uses on the island, all of which are private and residential.

Mr. Clapp's references to hunting lodges and other public uses appears misleading. The one "hunting lodge" on the head of the island is a private residence and has no commercial activities. Years ago, the Riverhead Lodge operated on the head of the island in a larger residence and lodged no more than 8 guests at a time, all of whom were guests of the lodge and supervised closely.

Many, many years ago the island had a British fort, a British shipbuilding facility, farms and a school house, but in modern time the island has been used only as private residences, the majority of which are on more 5 acres and 300 feet of waterfront.

Mr. Clapp's proposal is to have 46 campsites on less than 5 acres, so perhaps as many as 150 occupants on a 5-acre parcel. Mr. Clapp also proposes to reconstruct the Villa for use as a restaurant and bed and breakfast, a project many consider infeasible, so most likely the Villa waterfront would become only a lounging area for campers. All of this is entirely inconsistent with the current land uses on the island.

Mr. Clapp also proposes to develop the North Bay, an area recognized for its historic significance.

How such a use of the Villa lot would benefit the broader Cape Vincent community is not immediately obvious. Would Cape Vicent collect an occupancy tax sufficient to offset the diminished value of surrounding properties? Would the new town docks and parking areas be filled with island campers who spend little in the village? Would boat ramp fees and marina gas sales warrant such a use of the island? Would the real estate taxes realized on the proposed improvements be substantial, and offset loss of revenue by shore-based accommodations and restaurants, as well as the diminished value of other island properties?

If the Board intends to give consideration to this proposal, conditions on the permit should be considered and included to protect the interests of the many other island residents. A few that come to mind are:

1. Mr. Clapp should be required to prepare and present plans for how the safety of all guest and campers will be assured, how they will be transported to and from the island, how they would be accommodated and transported in the event of severe weather, how trespass and damage to other island properties will be prevented, etc.
2. Mr. Clapp should be required to take all reasonable actions to prevent the remaining Villa structure from being an "attractive nuisance", i.e., restricting access, and limiting and supervising all construction activities.
3. Mr. Clapp's use of North Bay and South Bay should not be disproportionate to other land owners' use and should not interfere with other landowners' quiet enjoyment of their waterfront property. More specifically, the size of the docks Mr. Clapp intends to build, and the number of boats visiting those docks, should be expressly limited.
4. None of the improvements intended by Mr. Clapp should impede the existing rights of way across the Villa lot and adjoining properties.
5. Mr. Clapp should be required to erect a substantial perimeter fence that prevents campers and guests from trespassing on adjoining properties.
6. Campers and guests should not be permitted to bring motor vehicles or pets to the island.
7. Campers should not be permitted to have open fires on any of the campsites.
8. Garbage and refuse should be collected and removed from the island daily, all in a manner that does not create a public nuisance.
9. The facilities constructed for toilets and showers should conform to all Cape Vincent building and sanitation codes, as well as the standards maintained at NY State Parks.
10. Mr. Clapp should be required to maintain a supervisory / security staff to oversee the camping facilities 24/7 and should post a bond for any damage or nuisance caused by guests or campers to adjoining properties.

I'd welcome the opportunity to discuss the foregoing concerns with you at your convenience.

Sincerely,

Todd G Atkinson
Owner of Lots 28-1-1.2 and 28-1-1.727
(402) 305-9811

ANDREW BOTT

To: Cody Higgins
Town Zoning Official
Codyh32686@gmail.com

11/30/2023

From: Andrew Bott & Christine Sebor
Tax Parcel 28.00-1-1.3
3472 Carleton Island Rd 1
Cape Vincent, NY

Ref: Special Use Permit Application submitted by Ron Clapp c/o Carleton Villa LLC 10/4/2023

Dear Cody and the Zoning Board,
We just received notification of the Special Use Permit Application submitted by Ron Clapp c/o Carleton Villa LLC. My name is Andrew Bott and I am an original homeowner on Carleton Island and New York State resident. Please submit to the Zoning Board this letter in opposition to the Special Use Permit Application submitted by Ron Clapp c/o Carleton Villa LLC for the commercial campground and cabin proposal on Carleton Island. Carleton Island is a residential area of private land and homeowners. The Island has no public sewage system, municipal water, or fire services. Over 90% of the Island is under conservation stewardship by the 1000 Islands Land Trust prohibiting commercial operations. The property owners submit to annual inspection voluntarily in an effort to conserve the natural beauty, wildlife habitat and water quality of Cape Vincent. As a long time homeowners on the Island we support the town, its restaurants, and fire and police services in addition to community events like the French Festival. It is important for the town to consider the costs for commercial activities, which may require police and fire services with no easy access and degradation to the environment and local wildlife. Under 7 acres is not sufficient to warrant this type of activity. Please reject this Special Use Permit Application.

Thank you,
Andrew Bott & Christine Sebor
Andrewbott9666@gmail.com

& ELISABETH
JOHN CHISHOLM

Carol Thomas

From: john chisholm <johnchisholm@yahoo.com>
Sent: Wednesday, November 29, 2023 3:36 PM
To: codyh32686@gmail.com
Cc: Carol Thomas
Subject: letter regarding Villa Special Use Peermit
Attachments: Dear Mr Higgins.docx

Chisholm

6610 Byrnes Drive

McLean, VA 22101

November 29, 2023

Dear Mr. Higgins,

We write as one of many Carleton Island property owners who have concerns about the Special Use Permit application made by Ron Clapp for the Villa Property on the head of Carleton Island. We, among others, have listened carefully to the communications made about plans for the future use of the property. The property is currently zoned for residential use. A request for a change in its status to include substantial camping/glamping facilities is a major development that was not prefaced by earlier communications, most made publicly.

I believe the interests of the adjacent property owners should hold paramount in the process of reviewing the application. I would further contend that all property owners on Carleton have an interest in expressing their reservations about a project that could change the character of the Island which they have, in varying degrees, invested time and resources. That many feel strongly about their ties to the Island should be clear in the reactions made thus far and by those to be further received by the Planning Board before the upcoming meeting be held December 4, 2023.

An attempt to bring the Villa back, or even to just postpone its degeneration, is something we thought was in the works. Guest rooms and dining were introduced as possibilities. Many of us wanted to be polite and avoid open displays questioning Mr. Clapp's plans and the feasibility of his idea to resurrect the earlier work of W. O. Wycoff. I think respect should be presumed. However, before commercial permits are issued credibility (financial and technical) needs to be established

The change in the character and scope of this project to include campground and glamping, as evidenced in the current Villa application compared to earlier communicated expectations, warrants a total rebuttal by the Zoning Board due to a spectrum of issues. These include safety, infrastructure requirements, compatibility with prior use, and the project's impact on neighbors both adjacent and approximate. I believe rather than granting this Permit, the Board should begin a serious evaluation of expressed plans to be developed to restore or rehabilitate the Villa itself. If it needs a special use permit to become a place to offer accommodations and meals, the hard infrastructure questions need to be explicitly addressed-especially including reconstruction, transportation and docking.

Legal representation of interested Carleton Island property owners needs to be accommodated. We are among those who would and will support such activity.

Sincerely,

John R. Chisholm

Elisabeth T. Chisholm

+1 571 389 0667 - Cell
+1 703 847 1795 - McLean

johnchisholm@yahoo.com

EILEEN COMERFORD

Carol Thomas

From: eileen Comerford <island.eileen@yahoo.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 28, 2023 8:51 PM
To: Carol Thomas
Subject: Rezoning of Property on Carleton Island

Carol,

This is the letter that Eileen sent

Dear Cody,

I am adding my voice to the other voices of residents on Carleton who are vehemently opposed to this special use rezoning.

Currently on the 1200 acres of land that make up Carleton there are 40 cottages. Mr. Clapp is petitioning to have 46 campsites on less than 7 acres. This is ludicrous more people on 7 acres than there on 1200 acres.

My second concern is what is to stop Mr. Clapp from selling this property at a huge profit once he obtains this special use permit. Having this permit will be a major selling point. If he doesn't proceed with renovating the Villa, which he states is his intention , will you have a clause that the special use permit will be retracted? Or a clause that this special use permit is issued to only Mr Clapp?

Why as a taxpayer in Cape Vincent am I not receiving the same opportunity as Mr Clapp to participate remotely in the upcoming board meeting ? We have paid taxes to Cape Vincent for over 24 years and have asked for nothing. Now we are asking the board to protect Carleton Island.

Why is this meeting occurring during the Holiday Season and at the time of year when the Carleton Island Residents are not able to physically attend this meeting ?
This is a decision with huge impact not only to the residents of Carleton but to the town of Cape Vincent.This issue should not be passed in the dark of the night. Does Cape Vincent financially and physically have the manpower to enforce the law and keep tax paying citizens safe from this onslaught of over 100 new people every week ?

My last concern is the spread of the invasive species Swallow-wort on Carleton. My husband and I started fighting Swallow-wort in 2010. We have spent countless days discovering, spraying and picking seed pods. I know campers are going to care less about the environmental health of Carleton and will out of ignorance or not caring spread this invasive species. Swallow-wort overtaking Carleton will decrease home values and your tax base. We put so much effort into the fight because we love the Island the natural grasses meadows and ensuing wild life. We took out a second mortgage on our home so we could buy the adjoining great lot . We bought it for conservation and to control the Swallow-wort on the property. Will all our effort be for naught if this special use permit is granted?

Please present my letter to the Planning Board.

Gratefully
Eileen T Comerford

Sent from my iPad

MIKE COMERFORD

Carol Thomas

From: Mike <mmm07@aol.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 28, 2023 8:48 PM
To: Carol Thomas
Subject: Carleton Island Villa Rezoning Request

Hi Carol,

Just wanted to share the email I sent to Cody.

Best regards,
Mike

Cody Higgins
Town Zoning Official
Codyh32686@gmail.com

Dear Cody,

My name is Michael J. Comerford and my wife Eileen and I have owned property on Carleton Island for 25 years. One of the big reasons we bought on Carleton was because of the zoning and the Conservation Easements that help to preserve and protect the natural beauty and environment of the Island.

I am writing to register my strong objections to the Town considering a special use rezoning for the Villa's property. Not only would that open up a Pandora's Box for other land owners to request the same thing, but also please consider that once you let that Genie out of the bottle there's no putting it back.

Carleton has a rich cultural heritage of historical significance including Fort Haldimand, the Indian Burial Grounds, North & South Bays, and the first Schoolhouse in Jefferson County. These are things worth conserving and protecting for future generations and could be adversely impacted by allowing a campground in the immediate area.

I would like to know why all the property owners on Carleton were not notified of this hearing since it will have a serious affect on their right to a "quiet enjoyment " of their properties. Seasonal residents support local businesses , do volunteer work, and are involved in many of the local community activities for a good portion of the year. Seasonal residents add a lot to the enrichment of the local community while putting very few demands or burdens on the Town for services. Many of us are aware of all the service that Clayton provides to Grindstone property owners, and yet we still chose to make our investments on Carleton. When was the last time the Town provided any services to Carleton?

Is the Town not concerned about alienating these stakeholders who have collectively paid a large amount of taxes over the years to support the Town and local school system? I would like to think that Town Officials are aware of this and would have more concern for those of us that have supported Cape Vincent for years over the requests of an out of town developer who has not yet delivered on his promise to restore the Villa.

I would also like to protest the decision to allow Ron Clapp the developer to attend Monday nights meeting by Zoom when no such courtesy has been extended to long time property owners who have a much bigger stake in this decision and more to lose than this developer. Why is this developer being afforded special privileges above and beyond that of tax paying constituents?

I also wish to state that I would not have any objections to considering a Special Use Permit to allow the Villa to function as a restaurant or a B&B. However, given the undisputed significance of Carleton Island, it is my belief and contention that a Special Use Permit is not the proper venue to evaluate the request for a Campground on Villa property. A Campground would not only be disruptive to the Island itself, it would also penalize and inflict a significant burden on property owners, and other stakeholders, A Campground goes against all the established zoning and easement restrictions that have long been in place on Carleton Island. Given the disruptive nature to the Island and its property owners, as well as other stakeholders, a more formal vetting of this request should be handled through a Zoning Change Request for the property.

Finally, why the rush to judgement so quickly and during the Holidays when seasonal residents are not there to voice their concerns?

For the reasons enumerated above, as well as many other concerns that have yet to be articulated, I formally request the Town to postpone this hearing until all the stakeholders (including environmental organizations) have an opportunity to fully understand and present their case to Town officials.

There is no legitimate reason to aceed to the developer's request for a rush to judgement via a "Special Use Permit" process for the Carleton Villa. Whatever is done should be done in the full light of day with a clear understanding of the ramifications that will impact the Town and and all other stakeholders.

Please have the wisdom and courtesy to postpone this important proceeding until all stakeholders have adequate time to let their concerns and voices be heard.

I would appreciate you presenting this letter to both the Town Board and the Planning Board

Sincerely,
Michael J. Comerford

Sent from my iPad

DAVID COCQUYT

Town of Cape Vincent

Zoning Board of Appeals

December 4, 2023

Re: Carleton Villa Special Use Application

Dear Zoning Board of Appeals,

My name is David Cocquyt, a member of RP North, LLC which owns a lot on Carleton Island. I am extremely concerned about the proposal for the Carleton Villa and its conversion to a seasonal campground and restaurant. The proposed use, with housing of 196 additional people on only 6.9 acres of land, will significantly negatively impact the quiet and untouched nature of the island. At capacity, this property would increase the occupancy of the island by 3-5 times the current summer residency.

The project does not meet the character of the island and its neighbors in any way. The impact of such a change to the island will increase occupancy significantly with transient visitors. With approximately 40 homes currently, the island functions as a community of neighbors who either get along or leave each other alone. The addition of so many visitors will surely result in additional problems and irreversibly change the unique character of the island community. The island is virtually free of litter and has minimal impacts beyond the walking and ATVs trails. Adding such a high number of visitors to the island will surely increase garbage and other impacts to a relatively untouched natural environment beyond the applicant's site. The site plan implies that the visitors to the Villa will be allowed to utilize the trail network across the island. Will the applicant be renting ATVs? Being that the trail system has very little usage now, the trails and environment are able to sustain the current impacts. If 196 new people each week are using these trails there will be significant environmental impacts and interactions with neighbors. The trail system is currently maintained in an irregular and as needed basis by different property owners. The network is informal at best and is not marked in any way. Adding additional traffic will almost certainly result in accidents with no emergency services immediately available. For owners and residents, this is a known factor and one that we are all prepared to deal with. For visitors there is not the availability of police, fire or EMS to respond to any serious issues that may arise. The addition of alcohol, both through visitors on vacation and the restaurant, will certainly lead to confrontations and incidents. The Town's ability to respond to foreseeable incidents should be factored into the decision-making process.

The proposed density of the site also poses environmental impacts. This is one of the lowest spots on the island and is proposing to clear and expand waterfront access. This, combined with large numbers of cabins and tent sites on septic system will pose specific challenges. The soils on most of the island are hard pack clays going to bedrock. This soil is not overly conducive to septic leach fields and could pose environmental problems in North Bay, which is frequented by many boaters during the summer.

This site also holds archeological significance. Dating back to precolonial times, the island has been a site of Native American encampments and burial grounds along with the Fort and ship

building that has been well documented. I strongly encourage the Town to require an archeological study.

The Special Use Application implies that a restaurant was established on the island in the "1990s or early 2000s." Being an owner since 2002 I have no knowledge of any restaurant ever operating on the island at that time. I ask the Town to confirm whether any past permits were issued for such an establishment. It also alludes to the history of the island being a bustling area with multiple businesses, a schoolhouse, hotel/lodging facilities. To be more specific, several of these uses were in place in the late 1800s or early 1900s but have not been in operation likely since the outbreak of World War II.

I want to ensure that the Town takes this application seriously and follows all steps necessary as laid out by the Zoning Laws. I ask that you clearly outline, on the record, the process that this Special Use Permit will need to take and ensure that the project requires a Site Plan Application to include submission of the Environmental Assessment Form. Given the density and environmental impacts, I feel strongly that this project will qualify for a Positive Declaration for State Environmental Review through SEQR and should require in-depth study of potential environmental and wetland impacts as well as detailed archeological study as the site adjoins an established historical site with significant activity dating back to before the founding of this country.

I also have significant concerns that the financial commitment to revitalizing the Villa is the promise to entice the Town into accepting this plan, only to abandon the Villa restoration in the future when operation of the resort is up and running. There is a reason the Villa has stood empty for 90 years, and while I would enjoy seeing it restored, I also see the reality in the dollars necessary to be able to accomplish this. Few have the funds available to make this a reality, and far fewer have the temperament to spend so much money with only seasonal use. The example of Boldt Castle shows one of the few success stories which required State ownership and significant grant dollars and tourist visits to make a reality.

The owners of Carleton Island will be watching this process closely to ensure the applicant and the Town are abiding by the necessary process.

Respectfully,

David Cocquyt
RP North, LLC

IAN GOLDEN

Carol Thomas

From: Harriett Sabo <hets915@roadrunner.com>
Sent: Wednesday, November 29, 2023 8:17 PM
To: Carol Thomas
Subject: Fwd: Concerns Re: Villa Variance Request

Begin forwarded message:

From: Ian Golden <iangolden@gmail.com>
Subject: Concerns Re: Villa Variance Request
Date: November 28, 2023 at 9:41:24 AM EST
To: codyh32686@gmail.com

Cody,

I hope this email finds you well. While I'm unable to attend Monday's meeting in person or via proxy, I would like to express concern with and opposition to the C/Glamping portion of Mr. Clapp's Villa Proposal being considered. While I wish him luck and success in restoration of the Villa, and joining the Carleton Island and larger Cape Vincent community, I don't know that the proprosed camping portion respects the intentional zoning and current land use that, at least for our family, recently drew us to Carleton Island. I believe there are significant concerns re: said use with regard to health, safety, economic and physical impact w/ infrastructure requirements, and quality of life, that are shared by many on the Island. I am in the communication loop with others, and while I could try to come in with a unique vantage point, ultimately my concerns are many of their concerns. With a lot on my own work and life plate at the moment, and in respect of your time, I'll be more efficient in saying that I concur w/ the sentiments and reservations already, or which will be, put forth by Todd Atkinson.

Thanks for the time and consideration,
Ian Golden
Owner, Carleton Island Parcel 28.00-1-1.93
607.339.5897

AJEC JOHNSON

Hickory Point Club
3089 Carleton Island Road 1
Cape Vincent

Dr. Frank Giaquinto Chair, Planning Board
Town of Cape Vincent
Care of Mr. Cody Higgins
1964 NYS Route 12E Cape Vincent, NY 13618

Mr. Edward Iludzenski
Chair, Zoning Board of Appeals Town of Cape Vincent
Care of Mr. Cody Higgins
1964 NYS Route 12E
Cape Vincent, NY 13618

Members of the boards,

I am writing as President of the Hickory Point Club. We are a group of 11 owners of 3089 Carleton Island Road 1 on Carleton Island. We are a not-for-profit that has had a presence on the island since 1950. We are limited to 12 members and conduct no commercial activity.

We are in collective agreement that the application pending for a special use permit and site plan review to allow for a 46-unit campground between North and South bays, adjacent to our property, should be denied, pursuant to cape Vincent Zoning Law, 2019 that defined Carleton Island as within the Island District.

We have a long history on the island dating back to John McFarlane's ownership. We predate the Patten Development that, carefully with the oversight of the Thousand Islands Land Trust, developed large building lots with a minimum of five acres, but with some over 100 acres. That planned development memorialized with a host of deed restrictions. allowed the building of private residences increased the island's population to the small community it is today.

We did not oppose the development in the 1980s though our members knew it would forever change the island that we had exclusive rights to use and helped maintain.

Both the Kernan and Millar Families, the other adjacent property owners, have written you in opposition to this project. Their letters also serve as strong cases as to why this campground should not be allowed to proceed. We have also learned that we are supported in our opposition from what we believe to be the entirety of the island community. If there are exceptions, they will be rare.

We were pleasantly surprised, yet cautiously optimistic, when Ronald Clapp of Palm Beach County Florida, purchased the Villa in 2021 with the intent to restore.

As neighboring property owners since the 1970s we have seen the Villa slowly decay to the point we have been concerned about it falling on our property.

It is an utter surprise to us, and it appears that Mr. Clapp's intent is not to restore the villa, but instead to use that as a guise to build a campground on land that has been undisturbed for more than 100 years.

This property identified for development includes artifacts from Fort Haldimand, which is adjacent and owned by the Thousand Island Land Trust. And artifacts of past shipbuilding activity.

Carleton Island, while once a bustling hub of activity as military installation and later agricultural center has never been a fully commercial zone. The brief time the restaurant was open at Riverhead Lodge, cannot be compared to the occupancy of 150 for the Villa's B&B and restaurant or the 46 occupants for the Glampground.

The installation of a campground will change the character of the island and destroy what history remains. The rapid deforestation of the shoreline in south bay this fall should serve as evidence of what is to come. Without warning and with heavy equipment a swath of shoreline was cleared, and a beaver hut destroyed. Mounds of splintered trees were left behind.

The members of the Hickory Point Club are in full support of restoring the Villa for personal use, but we are in full opposition to the commercialization of Government Point.

This proposal is the most significant land use questions that has arisen in Cape Vincent since the wind turbine proposals around 2008. In that case a through environmental impact study was required, and if this proposal is not outright denied, the same rigorous environmental impact assessments should be required before any permissions are granted.

Sincerely,

Alec Johnson
President

STEPHAN SABO

To: Cody Higgins (via email codyh32686@gmail.com)
From: Stephan Sabo
Re: Opposition to Special Use Permit Application for Carleton Island Lot #3
Date: December 1, 2023

Dear Mr. Higgins and the Cape Vincent Zoning Board,

I am writing to join a nearly unanimous group of landowners and stakeholders on Carleton Island to express my strong opposition to Ronald Clapp's Special Use Permit application for a 6.9-acre high-density campground/glampground on Carleton Island Lot #3. As a third-generation Carleton Islander, I value the unique beauty, isolation, and low-density character of our island, which this project threatens to disrupt.

Carleton Island was developed in the late 1980s with the express intent of maintaining its natural character and low density. Our community values privacy, space, and the ruggedness that comes from living in a place that is both hard to reach and sometimes dangerous to access. We have a history of self-reliance and community support, crucial given the limited emergency, law enforcement and infrastructure services provided by the town of Cape Vincent.

The proposed development as presented raises significant concerns that I believe should be given careful consideration before the town allows Mr. Clapp to embark on this endeavor.

Emergency Services and Safety: With the nearest fire boat based 13 miles away, The town should consider its plans to provide adequate emergency, fire and law enforcement support to an influx of visitors on the island. At a minimum the Cape Vincent Volunteer Fire and Law Enforcement should have properly equipped boats in the water and maritime trained staff available for response 24 hours a day.

- Is the town of Cape Vincent prepared for a late October mass casualty event when an overloaded and ill equipped boat of Clapp customers washes up on Featherbed Shoal?
- In the Watertown Daily Time, Clapp is quotes as saying "the site will work similarly to an Airbnb". Does this mean that up to 150 visitors will be on the property without any form of supervision? How does the town intend to enforce noise, trespassing and vandalism complaints in a manner that is rapid and not a burden to Island neighbors?
- Who is to provide food and supplies when 150 glampers unexpectedly need to stay a few more extra days due to inclement weather they had not planned for?

Infrastructure and Access: The development poses questions about the strain on both our self-maintained island infrastructure and the mainland infrastructure to support this business.

- It has been mentioned that Mr. Clapp intends to allow his customers to travel off of his property and explore the island. Carleton Island Road #1 and #2 are roads in name only. These ATV trails have no designated location and are maintained at the landowners expense on the landowners property. What types of infrastructure development will the town of Cape Vincent need to embark on to ensure Carleton Island's road systems are functional for the benefit of Mr. Clapp's Island explorers? This should include road improvements, signage and liability considerations.
- How are these campers getting to Carleton Island? A ferry? Their own boats? Does the town of Cape Vincent have adequate docking and parking facilities to accommodate this level of occupancy? Will the town and Mr. Clapp provide ADA accessible piers and accommodations on the Island and the Mainland?

Historical & Environmental Concerns: Carleton Island has gone to great lengths to preserve its natural habitats and historic places. The efforts and shared desires for a protected environment should not be ignored.

- The use of septic tanks for such a large facility on Mr. Clapp's low-lying karst topography lot is concerning. Detailed plans for waste management and environmental protection are necessary.
- Land use on or near any area of historic interest should be taken into consideration during this approval process. This campground is on-top-of and feet away from Ft. Haldimand, the remains of a War of 1812 period shipwreck and 100's of native and British graves. These sites are well documented. Before Mr. Clapp begins construction all State, Federal and Tribal stakeholders should be notified and a proper archeological study of his construction site should be performed before construction begins.

Credibility of the Developer: Publicly available information about Mr. Clapp's past projects raise serious doubts about his ability to successfully manage a development of this scale. On his public Carleton Villa facebook page he actively solicits donations to support his private endeavor and he speaks about his "Home on the Lava" AirBNB project in Hawaii as an example of his development success. A quick review of the VRBO listing

(https://www.vrbo.com/7281543ha) for this property has some illuminating reviews that paint a picture of this developments future operational state..

- **Wendy G. Aug, 24 2021** (2/10 Terrible) "Stay Away! ...You will notice a trend of issue after issue with lots of excuses, and other customers that have had trouble getting issues resolved due to a lack of cell phone coverage. We didn't even get to experience his rude neighbor - just the rude owner."

- **Leo C. Jan 10, 2021** (2/10 Terrible) "No electricity and threatening neighbor at the door - The place is nice and the location great (even though not the one on Google maps). However the electricity was not working and the neighbor did not want tourists there and got louder and more aggressive as the night went on. He ended up coming to the property door to threaten and insult us. There was no cell reception and the internet was not working as the electricity was off. Awful experience in a nice environment. I advise not staying there for anyone."

In addition, a search for Ronald Clapp on the Palm Beach County Clerk of Courts Website will uncover a history of real estate based bankruptcy that match identifying information provided in this application. (https://appsgp.mypalmbeachclerk.com/)

- A detailed plan and funds in escrow should be required for the removal of partially completed docks, infrastructure and the villa site if construction is terminated before completion. Neighbors should not be forced to live next to an abandoned construction site.

Zoning and Legal Considerations: This project seems to be in direct conflict with the Cape Vincent Zoning Code for the Island District. In closing I would like to highlight the definition of this district.

3.7 Island Districts

- *Carleton and Grenadier Islands have historic areas of interest as confirmed by the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation.* ***As such, land use on or near any area of historic interest will be taken into consideration during the approval process.*** *This district represents the most distinctive land use zone within the Town.*
- *Residents of the Islands District have a unique property and living arrangement; one that is both unconventional and independent.* ***Residents do not want or need elaborate infrastructure development.*** *The land-use plan for this District is focused*

principally on encouraging quality residential development with some capacity for limited, controlled commercial development, for example, restaurant, hotel, bed and breakfast.

The board must consider these concerns carefully, weighing the long-term impact on Carleton Island's community, environment and the dangerous precedent this spot zoning application would unleash if approved. It is crucial that any development aligns with the island's character, the needs of its residents and the intentions of the Zoning Code's authors.

Thank you for considering my perspective on this matter. I hope you can address these concerns at your next zoning meeting.

Sincerely,

Stephan Sabo
4912 Carleton Island Rd #1 & 517 N.Garden St. Lake City, MN

JULIE & NIK KERNAN SEARLES

Carol Thomas

From: Julia Kernan <jekernan@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, November 30, 2023 10:26 AM
To: codyh32686@gmail.com; Carol Thomas
Cc: Nik Searles
Subject: Carleton Island Villa and Campground Zoning Application

Town of Cape Vincent Zoning Board of Appeals
c/o Cody Higgins
Email address: codyh32686@gmail.com

11/30/2023

Dear Members of the Zoning Board of Appeals ,

We are Julia Searles and Nik Searles and are writing to express our strong opposition to the proposed commercial zoning request for the Carleton Island Villa property. Our family has had property on the head of the island for over 70 years and has been contributing to the Cape Vincent summer economy for generations. As concerned island residents, we believe the development of a bed and breakfast, glamping sites, and cabins will adversely affect our property and the surrounding Island environment.

The proposed development will significantly increase human and motorized traffic, disrupting the cleanliness and tranquility of our quiet island property. There are 5 homes on the head of the island and at most 10-15 people on the head of the island at any given time. Increasing that number up to an additional 200 will put a tremendous strain on the natural environment. The influx of visitors associated with the commercial activities poses environmental and safety issues, such as damage to our property and pollution to the surrounding water used for drinking water, bathing, and recreation. The construction of cabins and other structures will have a lasting impact on the local ecosystem, leading to erosion, disruption of wildlife habitats, and further pollution of surrounding water sources. Additionally, the Glamp camp has many cabins and huts on the neck of the island between North and South Bay, and right alongside our property. How is Mr. Clapp going to ensure that his guests are not trespassing on private properties, including our waterfront?

Additionally, the proposed Bed and Breakfasts / Glamp Camp, increased human activity, vehicle movement, and events will negatively impact our and other neighboring residents' quality of life by jeopardizing the tranquil environment.

The proposed use must not be more objectionable to nearby properties by reason of noise, odors, vibrations, dust, illumination, or other potential nuisance than the operation of any allowed use in the particular district.

- Mr. Clapp has himself stated on social media that he envisions parties and balls with fireworks on the property, this would pose potential nuisance as well as noise pollution.
- We have very little light on the head of the island, we do not have any lit pathways and public buildings. The addition of these structures will create light pollution and disruption to the natural environment
-

Adequacy of parking, vehicular circulation and infrastructure for the proposed use, and its accessibility to fire, police, and emergency vehicles.

- We currently do not have any paved roads and transportation is primarily through tractors and offroad vehicles. The increased foot traffic from an additional 200 people on a small stretch of land will greatly affect our footpaths and the surrounding natural environment
- How will a Marina Dock and heavy increase in boat activity affect North / South Bay which is used for recreation (scuba diving, snorkeling) fishing and swimming
- How will Mr. Clapp provide emergency services to his many guests as we are a 30 minute boat ride and some distance from hospitals and emergency services.
- Only a few years ago, we had catastrophically high levels of water rendering our docks and boathouses underwater for the summer. The proposed Glamping site is on the lowest stretch of land of the island. Removing all barriers (rocks, trees, brush) from the land will only allow more flooding.
-

I am also deeply concerned about the potential impact on the nearby historical ruins site, a valuable part of our local heritage. Any development in close proximity should be approached with great care and consideration. The proposed commercial activities may pose a threat to the preservation of this historical site, and I urge the Zoning Board to thoroughly assess and address these concerns.

In light of the above, I respectfully request that the zoning request be denied. The proposed development is not in the best interest of our community and will have lasting negative effects on the well-being of its inhabitants, the environment, and our historical heritage.
Thank you for your time and consideration.

Julia & Niklas Searles

CAROL THOMAS

Carol Thomas

From:	Carol Thomas
Sent:	Wednesday, November 29, 2023 11:49 AM
To:	Codyh32686@gmail.com
Subject:	Carleton Island Special Use Permit Application

Good morning Cody. I am writing to express my concerns on the Special Use Permit Application to be discussed at Public hearing on Monday, December 4. Please pass this correspondence along to the appropriate Board Members.

From looking at the minutes of recent board meetings, the speed which with this application process has progressed combined with the change in scope of the project, are alarming:

- At the 9/21/23 Town Board Meeting, Mr Clapp introduced himself and described his project as a bed and breakfast with a restaurant.
- At the 10/11/23 Planning Board Meeting, Mr. Clapp submitted a site plan review application and described his project as a Bed and Breakfast with a restaurant, and added that he would like to build cabins and safari tents for contractors to stay in while the villa is being renovated, which will take approximately 3 years
- At the 11/6/23 Zoning Board of Appeals Meeting, the special use permit was accepted, and there was discussion of holding the meeting my zoom or phone call to allow Mr. Clapp to attend as he will be in Florida.
- The Notice of Public Hearing set for 12/4/23 describes the project as a Bed & breakfast with a restaurant plus a campground/glampground and indicates that Mr. Clapp will attend via telephone

How will the planning board accommodate the participation of the numerous Carleton Island residents who are also not in Cape Vincent on the date of the meeting? **I'd like to request that this be meeting be held as a zoom meeting to allow participation from all concerned.**

I feel that the Planning Board should not approve this Special Use Application, for the following reasons:
- Carleton Island has historic areas of interest and land use on or near any area of historic interest must be taken into consideration during the approval process. What has been done by the Planning Board in this regard?
- Carleton Island has significant wildlife preserves which could be unknowingly harmed by an influx of customers unfamiliar with the delicate ecosystem. (As an example, customers could unknowingly spreading the invasive species of Swallow-wort on the island)
- Regarding standards of review for – the proposed use must not be objectionable to nearby properties. The objections being raised by many island residents are clearly significant.
- Compatibility of the proposed use with adjoining properties/the relationship of the size of the parcel to the intensity of commercial use – this concentration of lodgings is entirely the opposite of the residential restrictions on the island which are one dwelling on a minimum 5-acre lot.
- The project is simply not compatible with the traditional and historic character of the site and surrounding area.

Thank you for your consideration in this matter.

Carol Thomas
Carleton Island Resident

EMILY WATERMAN / EVAN FARRELL

Carol Thomas

From: Stephen W. Sabo <drsabo@roadrunner.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 28, 2023 6:59 PM
To: Carol Thomas
Subject: Fwd: Carleton Island proposal

Begin forwarded message:

From: Emily Waterman <ewaterman1123@gmail.com>
Subject: Carleton Island proposal
Date: November 28, 2023 at 3:50:02 PM EST
To: Codyh32686@gmail com

Cody Higgins
Town Zoning Official
Codyh32686@gmail.com

Dear Cody,
My name is Emily Waterman and I am a land owner on Carleton Island. My family lives too far to attend Monday's meeting; however, we would like to add a voice in opposition to the campground and cabin proposed by Carleton Villa, LLC. My family has been visiting the island since 2004 when my parents (Leanne and Steve Waterman) purchased a lot on the south facing side of the island. They subsequently purchased the adjoining lot for the sole purpose of conservation. In 2020 my husband (Evan Farrell) and I bought another adjoining lot, also for the purpose of conservation.

I will not repeat what others have said, the purpose of this email is to add a voice. We agree with the concerns put forth by other community members regarding the environmental impact and safety issues.

Thank you,
Emily Waterman and Evan Farrell
ewaterman1123@gmail.co m

--
Emily Waterman, PhD
Faculty Member in Developmental Psychology
Bennington College | bennington.edu
Barn 230
One College Drive
Bennington, Vermont 05201-6003
ewaterman1123@gmail.com | emilywaterman@bennington.edu
she/her/hers

LEANNE WATERMAN

Carol Thomas

From: Leanne Waterman <leannewaterman0@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, November 30, 2023 6:39 PM
To: Carol Thomas
Cc: Harriett Sabo; ealside93@gmail.com; Atkinson Todd G; Bott Andrew; Comerford Eileen; Danny D'agustino; evan@evanfarrell.com; Geiger Devon; Glamber Sam And Lois; Jani Glantz; Joli Glantz; Golden Ian; alec.e.johnson@gmail.com; Kernan Anne; Kernan David; Lawrence Les; CHRISTINE AND ADRIAN MARTIN; McQueeny Jim; Millar William; Reinholtz Danielle; Rienholtz Dan; Roes Brian; Roes Vicki; Sabo Graham; Sabo Harriett; Sabo Stephan; Skinner Scott; Stiefel Deb/John; Tibbles Jake; Truman Jeff; Truman Josh; ewaterman1123@gmail.com; Sabo Stephen W.; mmoore@granitefiberoptics.com; Glantz Ava; Chisholm John; Ferguson Bill; Charles Millar; Comerford Mike; djdelectric@live.com; Chisholm Libby
Subject: Re: Letters for meeting

Hi Carole,

Thank you for all your efforts here! Below is a copy of the letter I just sent to Cody; please feel free to share as you see fit.

Dear Cody,

As property owners on Carleton Island in the Town of Cape Vincent, we feel a deep sense of responsibility to help our community preserve this unique natural, historical, and cultural heritage treasure. We both come from families that have summered in the region going back several generations. Twenty years ago, when it came time to purchase property on the River, we chose Carleton Island after extensive searching. We chose this land specifically because of the isolated and sometimes formidable natural habitat, and despite all the hardships thus incurred. Indeed, we have spent a considerable majority of our family resources in purchasing another lot for the sole purposes of conservation, and our daughter and son-in-law have followed suit.

We are frankly alarmed at the alacrity with which the request for a Special Use permit by Mr. Clapp is being pushed through. Having only heard of this proposal a few days ago, we are unable to be in attendance at the December 4th meeting. Furthermore, there has not been sufficient time to study the potential environmental impact of this project. For one example, we are concerned about the impact on the local fishery, an ecosystem that is in a very delicate balance, and upon which many of our neighbors in the town of Cape Vincent rely to draw in tourist traffic. In addition, of particular concern to us is the impact on the loca fauna and flora, such as the population of Bobolink, which are listed as an uncommon species, yet can be found to inhabit the meadow immediately adjacent to the proposed campground. Not to mention, one of the major rookeries of the Great Blue Heron is found on the island, and produces many of this species for which the region is known and celebrated.

The historical and cultural significance of the island cannot be over-emphasized. The proposed site of the project is alarmingly close to the Fort Haldimand site, and is included in the buffer zone of the Burial Grounds of the Awkwasasne Mohawk nation. With the amount of visitors proposed, the pressure on these precious areas cannot be overestimated. Currently, there are no provisions for guarding and managing these sites. While these sites can and should be used to encourage tourism

and interest in the history of our region, as such, they must be preserved in perpetuity, and this requires much expert study and planning.

As healthcare providers with experience as first responders, we are especially concerned regarding the provision of emergency services. Weather often can severely hamper travel to and from the mainland, thus further taxing, and perhaps even endangering, our local volunteer fire department in the event of the medical or fire emergencies that certainly must accompany an influx of campers. Whereas long-term inhabitants of the island understand the risks inherent to being so isolated from emergency services, weekend campers will not share the same level of knowledge of, or commitment to, necessary safety precautions. Also under consideration is the necessity for providing for the safe policing of these visitors and the island inhabitants, which of course is complicated by our proximity to the international border.

Certainly, the proposal submitted by Mr. Clapp does not address the potential issues addressed above, nor does it offer any plans to mitigate any such problems. At the very least, we are seeking time to study these potential problems, and urge the members of the board to carefully weigh the potential long- term losses that may be incurred against any immediate, short-term gains that may arise by approving this proposal in an expedient manner.

Respectfully in service,

Leanne and Steven Waterman
Owners, lot 28.00-1-1.42

On Wed, Nov 29, 2023 at 9:24 AM Carol Thomas <cthomas@claytonmarina.com> wrote:

I will be attending Monday's Public Hearing -

Here is a list of the letters I have:

Emily Waterman/Evan Farrell

Christine & Adrian Martin

Todd Atkinson

Steph Sabo

Het Sabo

Mike Comerford

Eileen Comerford

If anyone else wants to forward me their letter please send it to – cthomas@claytonmarina.com Of course, if you would prefer me not to have your letter in hand just let me know.