

# Carleton application against zoning requirements

Dec 1, 2023

1 of 2



An artists rendering of a campground proposed for Carleton Island t owner is opposed to. Cape Vincent zoning application photo

This letter is in response to Ronald Clapp's applications for the issuance of a Special Use Permit and for a Site Plan Review, pursuant to the Town of Cape Vincent Zoning Law, 2019. For the reasons below, we request that the Zoning Board of Appeals deny Mr. Clapp's application for the issuance of a Special Use

Permit for both the so-called campground/glampground and the Villa bed and breakfast restoration.

My brother and I are adjoining landowners to Mr. Clapp's site. Our family has resided on the Island for over 100 years and we were the former owners of the Villa premises.

First, as a matter of procedure, which is of course form over substance, these are essentially two separate projects and therefore each project should have its own applications made to the Zoning Board of Appeals and to the Planning Board.

As to the substance, Mr. Clapp's proposals are entirely inconsistent with the Town's Zoning Law intent for the land use within an Island District which is, "focused principally on encouraging quality residential development with some capacity for limited, controlled commercial development, for example, restaurant, hotel, bed and break- fast."

Additionally, it is contrary to, "A Joint Comprehensive Plan for the Village and Town of Cape Vincent", Section 7, "Land Use," specifically that subsection for Island areas, which contains the following:

Area 4 Fox and Grenadier Islands in Lake Ontario  
Linda and Carleton Islands in the St. Lawrence River.

Encourage: Large lot seasonal residential use with boat access. Maintain scenic resources, the natural setting and preserve open spaces to the greatest

extent possible. Consider the use of open space easements and ensure adequate protection of the important historical-archeological resource, Ft. Haldiman.

Discourage: Any type of development that would diminish or degrade the unique rural community lifestyle these islands provide to their owners. Any commercial or utility development whose influence would have a negative impact on health, safety, scenic and natural resources, property values, recreational opportunities and tourism assets.

The head of Carleton Island is a residential area, as is the remainder of the Island. At one time there was a so-called hunting and fishing lodge (the “Riverhead Lodge,”) located at the Head. It included a small restaurant operation. Usually there were no more than eight to ten overnight patrons, if any, at the lodge. Upon best recollection, the restaurant accommodated twenty people, at most, and there was only one seating. The staff consisted of a cook, two wait/housekeeping personnel and the owner. Furthermore, it was established before the Town of Cape Vincent enacted a zoning law. It has not been in operation for over twenty-three years.

Also, the application references current “hunting lodges,” which is or may be misleading. There are some property owners who not only use their residences throughout the spring, summer and fall for their families, but they also continue until the close of hunting season.

The campground/glampground and a bed and breakfast, that apparently accommodates 150 occupants and/or employees, are not compatible or consistent with the use of the adjoining properties which are residential. The proposed uses do not comport with the Town's long term goals. The proposed uses would have a negative impact on the immediate area, and certainly are not controlled and limited.

Furthermore, the proposals, by their very nature, do not meet the Standards of Review (Zoning Law 5.3.2.e.6), such as, but not limited to: objectionable noise, odors, illumination and potential nuisance; the compatibility, again, of the proposed use and the intensity of the commercial use; enforcement of the hours of operation that may be imposed necessary to ensure compatibility of the surrounding area; and, compatibility of the traditional and historic character of the area.

We also believe that the "Town of Cape Vincent. Special Use Permit Application," that has been submitted, is not adequate.

It is difficult to comment on the survey or site plan that has been made available. It is illegible, perhaps due to scale.

Also, there is no discussion in regards to the scope and size of the bed and breakfast plan. Mr. Clapp has submitted two pictures of the Villa - one current and one from the 1890's or early 1900's, and nothing further.

We, therefore, request that the Zoning Board of Appeals deny Mr. Clapp's application. Respectfully,

Charles Millar

Carleton Island